**Public Document Pack** 



### **Local Government Pensions Board**

Date: FRIDAY, 6 OCTOBER 2017

Time: 1.45 pm

Venue: COMMITTEE ROOM - 2ND FLOOR WEST WING, GUILDHALL

Members: Alderman Ian Luder James Tumbridge Jon Averns Yvette Dunne Christina McLellan Martin Newnham

Enquiries: Chris Rumbles tel. no.: 020 7332 1405 christopher.rumbles@cityoflondon.gov.uk

> Lunch will be served in the Guildhall Club at 1pm NB: Part of this meeting could be the subject of audio or video recording

> > John Barradell Town Clerk and Chief Executive

#### AGENDA

#### 1. APOLOGIES

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

#### 3. **MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING** To agree the public minutes of the meeting on 7<sup>th</sup> July 2017.

For Decision (Pages 1 - 6)

4. **OUTSTANDING ACTIONS** Report of the Town Clerk.

> For Information (Pages 7 - 8)

5. **THE CITY CORPORATION'S LGPS - UPDATE** Report of the Chamberlain.

> For Information (Pages 9 - 18)

6. **TRAINING UPDATE** Verbal update of the Senior Pensions Administrator.

> For Information BOARD

#### 7. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE BOARD

#### 8. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

 EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC MOTION - That under Section 100(A) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following items on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part I of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

For Decision

#### Part 2 - Non-Public Agenda

10. **DRAFT ANNUAL REPORT YEAR ENDING 31 MARCH 2017** Report of the Chamberlain.

> For Information (Pages 19 - 88)

11. ADMITTED BODIES

Report of the Chamberlain.

For Information (Pages 89 - 92)

- 12. NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE BOARD
- 13. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED

## Agenda Item 3

#### LOCAL GOVERNMENT PENSIONS BOARD

#### Friday, 7 July 2017

## Minutes of the meeting of the Local Government Pensions Board held at the Guildhall EC2 at 1.45 pm

#### Present

#### Members:

Alderman lan Luder	Yvette Dunne
James Tumbridge	Christina McLellan
Jon Averns	Martin Newnham

#### Officers:

Caroline Al-Beyerty	-	Chamberlain's Department
Kate Limna	-	Chamberlain's Department
Jeff Henegan	-	Chamberlain's Department
Tom Broughton	-	Chamberlain's Department
Tracey Jansen	-	Town Clerk's Department - Human Resources
Chris Rumbles	-	Town Clerk's Department

#### 1. APOLOGIES

There were no apologies for absence.

#### 2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

There were no declarations of interests.

#### 3. COURT ORDER

The order of the Court, appointing the Board and setting its terms of reference, was received.

#### 4. ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN

In accordance with Standing Order 29, the Board proceeded to elect a Chairman for the year ensuing. The Town Clerk read a list of Members eligible to stand and Ian Luder, being the only Member expressing his willingness to serve was duly elected as Chairman.

#### 5. ELECTION OF DEPUTY CHAIRMAN

In accordance with Standing Order No 30, the Board proceeded to elect a Deputy Chairman for the ensuing year. The Town Clerk read a list or Members eligible to stand and James Tumbridge, being the only Member expressing his willingness to serve, was duly elected as Deputy Chairman.

#### 6. MINUTES OF THE PREVIOUS MEETING

**RESOLVED** – That the public minutes of the meeting on 26<sup>th</sup> April 2017 are approved as an accurate record.

#### Matters Arising

#### Pension Opt Out Figures

Members noted the pension opt-out figures totalled 380 out of a workforce of 3800. It was suggested a staff survey might prove beneficial in understanding how the scheme is seen amongst staff.

It was agreed that a comparison to other Local Authorities will be carried out initially to establish if the City Corporation's opt out figures are out of kilter with the national picture.

#### **Training**

Members noted that the training needs assessment is being reviewed. It was noted that the Police Pensions Board had similar training requirements and that the intention is to conduct some joint training. Training plans will be formulated once all the training needs assessment forms have been received.

#### Date of next meeting

Friday 6<sup>th</sup> October 2017, 1.45pm was agreed for the next meeting. Town Clerk agreed to circulate suggested options and timeframes for meetings in 2018.

#### 7. WORK PROGRAMME

The Board considered a report of the Town Clerk which set out a proposed Work Programme for the Board's next three meetings.

**RESOLVED –** That the Board notes the report.

#### 8. **NEW STARTER INDUCTION**

The Board received a report of the Director of HR outlining information provided to new starters on the Local Government Pension Scheme.

The Head of Corporate HR advised Members that the Jobs page on the intranet is about to be refreshed and this will include information relating to the LGPS. It has also been agreed that as part of the induction process for new starters the Pensions Manager will attend the Town Clerk's new starter welcome lunches going forward to be available to answer any questions. Online FAQs for new starters will also now include information relating to the LGPS.

In response to a comment from the Chairman, the Head of Corporate HR agreed that the '10 good reasons to join the LGPS' could include information relating to the 50:50 contribution (i.e. contributions are halved and the pension is built up at half the normal rate). The Head of Corporate HR suggested the leaflet would be amended to incorporate the 50:50 option. It was confirmed that information relating to the Local Government Pension Scheme is available to all employees on the intranet.

In response to a question from a Member, the Chamberlain advised that new starters are advised of the option to transfer funds in to the Local Government Pension Scheme. It was highlighted that a good number of new employees are aware of this option as is evidenced by the number that do it. Staff are reminded that they have up to one year to transfer in to the LGPS nine months after they join the City Corporation.

The Chairman commented that it would be useful to know how many of those opting out are longstanding employees or how many are new starters.

**Resolved:-** That the report is noted.

#### 9. PENSION SCHEME UPDATE

The Board received a report of the Chamberlain that provided information on a range of topics relating to the Local Government Pension Scheme.

The Chamberlain advised that annual pension statements are in the process of being prepared for issue on 31<sup>st</sup> August. It was confirmed that the 31<sup>st</sup> August deadline is a statutory deadline and it is always a time of year that presents workload challenges for the team.

In response to a question from a Member, it was acknowledged that additional resources will not be needed and that the deadline will be met.

#### **Risk Register**

The Chamberlain updated Members in relation to the risk register highlighting changes to the risk level for item 1 and 5 as agreed at the last meeting and advising of the decision to add insolvency at item 6. It was confirmed the LGPS risk register will now be logged on the City Corporation's central risk management system.

A Member referred to Data Protection and changes to legislation that will come in to force in March 2018 regarding storage of personal information. Changes will be introduced that will require a seven step process to be complied with, for audit purposes. It was agreed this information will be circulated to the Board.

The Deputy Chamberlain advised that Data Protection is on the Strategic Risk Register, but that reference could be made to this on the LGPS Risk Register.

The Chairman acknowledged that Data Protection is a strategic risk, but that this Board should see it at a local level. It was agreed that that the Board will receive a report on data protection to map against comments regarding changes to legislation

In response to a question from a Member, the Chamberlain confirmed that it is the Board that determines the level of risk attached to each item on the risk register and that it had previously been determined that inappropriate investment was considered unlikely. It is for the Board to decide if this has now changed.

It was agreed that risk 3 (inappropriate investment) will remain as unlikely.

#### 10. **QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE BOARD** There were no questions.

#### 11. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT

#### Annual Workshop for Local Government Pension Boards.

A Member updated the group on his recent attendance at a workshop remarking that it had proved to be a very interesting day to see how other schemes operated and also provided a good chance to network.

The day provided for lively and interesting debate with a key presentation by the scheme advisory board. The following areas were covered during the day:-

- Data Protection 2018.
- A need for sharing and transparency of information between schemes and a central depository.
- Establishment of a national network and creating a standard email address to share data.
- Streamlining the appeals process to the ombudsman.
- Pension fund deficits, with the City Corporation sitting somewhere in the middle.
- Training with people not understanding their legal requirements.
- Continuity of Members; having a staggered process of election to the Board so there is succession planning. There is a potential issue for this Board as all members were elected at around the same time and on the same terms.
- Pooling and standardising of payroll software for all the different schemes.

The Member advised that it was a day that was well worth attending and provided useful discussion and networking opportunities. It was suggested Board Members take the opportunity to attend in future if they are able to do so.

It was agreed that the slide pack from the day will be circulated to the board.

#### **Pensions Manager**

The Chamberlain advised that a new Pensions Manager is still to be recruited. Applications received in response to the recent advert were not considered suitable. A further advert will go out again in the autumn and if this is not successful then a re-think will be needed.

In response to a question from a Member, the Chamberlain explained that they are looking for someone with experience in pension funds covering police, judges and LGPS and this presents difficulties within Local Government as the pool of people with this experience is becoming smaller and smaller.

The Chairman commented that someone is needed in this role with a persona and that is able to engage with Members and not just someone with technical ability

#### Committee Terms

The Chairman indicated his intention to step down in 2019 to allow another Member to join the board that will then allow a smooth transition in employer representative on the Board.

A Member commented that all Members have been appointed to the Board on four year terms and it would sensible to stagger the terms. The Chairman advised that Audit & Risk Management Committee re-appoint Members on unequal terms so that term endings are staggered.

#### Sharing of Information

In response to a question from a Member regarding a voluntary code to abide by, the Chamberlain confirmed that information relating to the City Corporation's Pension Scheme expenses and operating costs are already shared. When sharing there is a need to be careful in how data is used. When slides from the conference are circulated this will be looked at to see how the City Corporation is impacted.

#### **Data Protection and Succession Planning**

A Member asked for data protection and succession planning to be added to the agenda at the next meeting.

#### 12. EXCLUSION OF THE PUBLIC

RESOLVED – That under 100A(4) of the Local Government Act 1972, the public be excluded from the meeting for the following item on the grounds that they involve the likely disclosure of exempt information as defined in Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act.

## Item No.Paragraph No.133

#### 13. PENSION FUND - DRAFT STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS

The Board considered a report of the Chamberlain providing information relating to the draft Pension Statement of Account.

The Chamberlain highlighted the growth in pension fund asset value over the year as a result of high returns in the global stock markets. The fund remains on target to meet its 17 year deficit reduction plan. Depending on various macroeconomic factors the funding position is liable to fluctuate over time.

It was highlighted that people coming in to the scheme are critical in enhancing the funding position, particularly as this is a mature fund.

In response to a question from a Member, it was confirmed that employee contribution levels are set by government and the employer contribution set by Finance Committee every three years following the actuary's triennial valuation. Employee contribution levels are tiered dependent on salary. If the Government considers there is a growing gap in the funding position of the scheme on a national basis then levels can be changed.

The Chairman referred to Finance Committee's decision to uphold the original 17 year deficit reduction target, which is to be welcomed by this Committee.

The Chamberlain emphasised that this report is only a draft set of accounts and that they were currently being audited by the external auditors. Regular meetings take place between officers and auditors and early indication is that the main statements and figures will remain as they are, but some of the supporting wording will change before the accounts are presented to Audit &

Risk Management Committee and Finance Committee in July. It was confirmed that the annual report will come to the next meeting of this Board.

The Chairman asked that a report is presented at the next meeting on admitted bodies and liability and whether there are bond agreements in place to secure liability funding..

## 14. NON-PUBLIC QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE BOARD

There were no non-public questions.

15. ANY OTHER BUSINESS THAT THE CHAIRMAN CONSIDERS URGENT AND WHICH THE COMMITTEE AGREES SHOULD BE CONSIDERED WHILST THE PUBLIC ARE EXCLUDED There was no other business

There was no other business.

The meeting closed at 3.00pm

------

Chairman

Contact Officer: Chris Rumbles Tel. no.: 020 7332 1405 christopher.rumbles@cityoflondon.gov.uk

#### Local Government Pension Board - Outstanding Actions List

	Date	Action	Officer responsible	To be completed/ progressed to next stage	Progress Update
1.	July 2017	Comparison to other Local Authorities	Corporate Treasurer & Acting Pensions Manager	Verbal update at Board	There is no official data on opt-out rates for the LGPS. At a London Pension Officer Group meeting in September it was agreed to conduct a survey on opt- out rates from the LGPS in London. The results of survey will be advised to the Board once the survey has been completed.
2.	July 2017	2018 Meetings	Town Clerk	Completed	Suggested date for LGPS meeting has been circulated.
3.	July 2017	Annual Workshop for Local Government Pensions Board	Town Clerk	Completed	Information from the Pensions Board conference has been circulated to the Board
Peige 7	July 2017	Data Protection 2018	Corporate Treasurer & Acting Pensions Manger	Verbal Update at Board	At the present time it is unclear what the new legislation will look and advice is presently limited. An action plan is being drawn up by the Information Officer for the City of London Corporation as whole. The Local Government Association is also working on updating communications and commissioning work with the law firm Squire Patton Boggs to provide further guidance on General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR).
5.	July 2017	Succession Planning	Town Clerk	Verbal update at Board	Terms of Membership on the Board to be to be reviewed to allow for these to be staggered for succession planning purposes.
6.	July 2017	Admitted Bodies and liability	Corporate Treasurer/ Comptroller & City Solicitor	October Board	On the agenda.

Page 8

### Agenda Item 5

Committee:	Date:		
Local Government Pensions Board	6 October 2017		
Subject:	Public		
The City Corporation's LGPS - Update			
Report of:	For Information		
The Chamberlain			
Report author:			
Jeff Henegan – Chamberlain's Department			

#### <u>Summary</u>

At the Board's meeting on 20 October 2016, it was agreed that information regarding a range of topics in relation to the Corporation's Local Government Pensions Scheme (the Scheme) would be provided at each meeting. Members have indicated that information regarding communications be provided on an annual basis and all of the other items of information will be provided at each meeting except for when there is no updated information since the previous meeting

Item	Update			
Annual schedule of events for the Pensions Scheme	Update provided (Appendix A)			
Documentation of all of the communications which are circulated to Scheme Members	No amendments since the last Board meeting.			
Information of admitted bodies to the Scheme	Further information to be provided to the next meeting.			
Information of Scheme Record Keeping	No amendments since the last Board meeting.			
The Pensions Board's Risk Register	No amendments since the last board meeting (Appendix B)			
A record of any complaints or disputes under the Scheme's complaints procedure	Two new appeals (Appendix C).			
Any recent breaches of the law	None to report.			
Any audit reports relating to the administration of the Scheme	None to report.			
Any reports relating to the administration of the Pension Scheme which have been considered by other Committees	None to report.			

Members are requested to review this information and provide any comments regarding it.

The board requested details of opt-out rates to see if the City Corporation's pension opt out figures are out of kilter with the national picture. There is no official data on opt-out rates from the LGPS. At a London Pension Officer Group meeting in September it was agreed to conduct a survey on opt-out rates from the LGPS in London. The results of survey will be advised to the board once the information has been received.

#### Recommendation

The Board is recommended to consider the information provided in the following reports and provide any comments in relation to this information.

#### Appendices:

Appendix A – Annual Schedule of Events Appendix B – Risk Register & Risk Matrix Appendix C – List of Appeals

#### Contact:

Jeff Henegan Telephone: 020 7332 1355 Email: jeff.henegan@cityoflondon.gov.uk

#### Local Government Pensions - Schedule of Events 2017

Date Due	Event	Completed
31 <sup>st</sup> January	HMRC Event 22 Report – List of Annual Allowance cases exceeding the Previous years' threshold.	29 January 2017
Within 2 weeks of quarter date	Tax return for Quarter 4 (to 31/3/2017)	6 April 2017
1 <sup>st</sup> April	Employee Contribution band review/ implementation.	<ul> <li>Payroll notified 28/3/2017.</li> <li>Adjustments effective from 1/4/2017</li> </ul>
1 <sup>st</sup> April	Employer contribution implementation.	<ul> <li>Payroll notified 2/2/2017.</li> <li>New rates effective from 1/4/2017</li> </ul>
1 <sup>st</sup> April	Revaluation of CARE benefits.	<ul> <li>Software updated 9/3/2017.</li> <li>Revaluation effective from 1/4/2017</li> </ul>
1 <sup>st</sup> Monday in April following the 6 <sup>th</sup>	Pensions Increase – Annual Inflation increase.	<ul> <li>Pensions software updated 9/3/2017.</li> <li>Payroll updated 27/3/2017.</li> <li>Increase effective from 10/04/2017.</li> </ul>
8 <sup>th</sup> June	Audit of Pension Fund Accounts begins	Audit commence 8 June 2017
30 <sup>th</sup> June	Target date for the issue of annual updates to Deferred members.	To be updated at the Board Meeting.
Within 2 weeks of quarter date	Tax return for Quarter 1 (to 30/06/2017)	30 June 2017
July	Draft accounts to Audit & Risk Mgt Cttee (24 July) and Finance Cttee (25 July).	Completed
31 <sup>st</sup> August	Issue of Annual Statements deadline.	31 August 2017
30 <sup>th</sup> September	Publication of Pension Fund Accounts and Annual Report	
Within 2 weeks of quarter date	Tax return for Quarter 2 (to 30/09/2017)	
30th September	Employee Contribution Band review	
1 <sup>st</sup> October 2017	Write to employees affected by end of transitional delay	
Within 2 weeks of quarter date	Tax Return for Quarter 3 (to 31/12/2017)	

#### City of London LGPS Risk Register for the LGPS Pensions Board - FOR CONSIDERATION

Risk			Cause	Effect			Curren	nt Risk	-		Tar	get Risk	
No.	Risk (Short description)	Risk Owner			Existing Controls	Likelihood	Impact	Rating	Direction	Planned Actions	Likelihood	Impact	Ratin
1	Inappropriate Investment Strategy	Chamberlain	(i) Inappropriate investment advice. (ii) Advice ignored	<ul> <li>(i) Inappropriate risk/return profile.</li> <li>(ii) Opportunities not maximised to progress towards full funding</li> <li>(iii) Ramifications on employers contributions.</li> </ul>	Investment strategy devised to reduce financial risk through use of asset allocation and a range of Fund Managers implementing different investment mandates. Monitoring of fund managers' performance by Chamberlain & Financial Investment Board. Information on market conditions provide by Investment Consultant.	Unlikely	Major	Amber 8	↔	Review of asset allocation by Investment Consultant following triennial valuation	Unlikely	Major	Ambe 8
2	Unsuitable triennial actuarial valuation leading to inappropriate employer rates	Chamberlain	(i) Inappropriate assumptions used by the Actuary (ii) Inaccurate data supplied to the Actuary	Employer rates unsuitable to	<ul> <li>(i) Regular meetings with the Actuary to ensure that assumptions are appropriate involving nominated Members of the Finance Cttee, with final report to Finance Cttee.</li> <li>(ii) prompt clearance of queries from Actuary.</li> <li>(iii) Robust Year End procedures and updates.</li> <li>(iv) Checking for errors or inconsistencies in valuation extract report before submission to the Actuary.</li> </ul>	Rare	Minor	Green 1	¢	Continue existing controls	Rare	Minor	Gree 1
3	Failure to comply with legislative requirements.	Chamberlain	<ul> <li>(i) Lack of consultation with appropriate persons.</li> <li>(ii) Lack of training/ appropriately skilled staff</li> </ul>	(i) Inaccurate benefits paid. (ii) Financial loss. (iii) Increase in Appeals. (iv) Fines from Pensions Regulator (v) Reputational damage	<ul> <li>(i) Recruitment of suitable staff appropriate salary levels.</li> <li>(ii) Formal Institute of Payroll Professionals training.</li> <li>(iii) Attendance at seminars and Forums, webinars and user groups.</li> <li>(iv) Knowledge updates via LGA training sessions</li> </ul>	Possible	Minor	Green 3	¢	Continue existing controls	Possible	Minor	Gree 3
4	Pension Scheme Administration	Chamberlain	<ul> <li>(i) Ineffective succession planning.</li> <li>(ii) Inadequately trained staff.</li> <li>(iii) Absences/increased staff turnover.</li> <li>(iv) IT system failure.</li> <li>(v) Data Accuracy.</li> <li>(vi) Lack of resources.</li> </ul>	heveleb	<ul> <li>(i) Recruitment and training of staff.</li> <li>(ii) Ensuring software is the latest version and any known errors are reported.</li> <li>(iii) Ensure IT have sufficient back-ups and Disaster Recovery. (iv) Ensuring training opportunities are shared.</li> <li>(v) Robust checking procedures in place at all stages of record management from new starters, transfers received, career changes, pension top-ups, leaving and benefit payment.</li> <li>(vi) If staff or other resources are lacking ensure priority cases are covered and all checking levels maintained.</li> </ul>	Unlikely	Serious	Green 4	↔	Continue existing controls	Unlikely	Serious	Gree 3 4
5	Pension Fund Fraud	Chamberlain	<ul> <li>(i) Not notified of death.</li> <li>(ii) Staff acting inappropriately</li> </ul>	following death. (ii) Overpaid pensions.	<ul> <li>(i) Use of Mortality Screening Service and Tell Us Once Service (Government initiative that allows us to be notified of a death when registered).</li> <li>(ii) Participation in the National Fraud Initiative.</li> <li>(iii) Sending Life Certificates to Overseas Pensioners.</li> </ul>	Unlikely	Minor	Green 2	¢	Continue existing controls	Unlikely	Minor	Gree 2
	Employer becomes insolvent or is abolished with insufficient funding to meet liabilities	Chamberlain/ Comptroller & City Solicitor	Processes not in place to capture or review covenant of individual employers.	Fund would pick up the liabilities potentially leading to increased contribution rates for other employers.	Bond/guarantor sought for potential new admitted bodies and incorporated into admission agreements where appropriate.	Possible	Serious	Amber 6	↔	Annual review of employer covenants particularly where bonds/guarantors are required	Unlikely	Serious	Gree 4

Page 14

City of London Corporation Risk Matrix (Black and white version) Note: A risk score is calculated by assessing the risk in terms of likelihood and impact. By using the likelihood and impact criteria below (top left (A) and bottom right (B) respectively) it is possible to calculate a risk score. For example a risk assessed as Unlikely (2) and with an impact of Serious (2) can be plotted on the risk scoring grid, top right (C) to give an overall risk score of a green (4). Using the risk score definitions bottom right (D) below, a green risk is one that just requires actions to maintain that rating. 

# (A) Likelihood criteria

	Rare (1)	Unlikely (2)	Possible (3)	Likely (4)
Criteria	Less than 10%	10 – 40%	40 75%	More than 75%
Probability	Has happened rarely/never before	Unlikely to occur	Fairly likely to occur	More likely to occur than not
Time period	Unlikely to occur in a 10 year period	Likely to occur within a 10 year period	Likely to occur once within a one year period	Likely to occur once within three months
Numerical	Less than one chance in a hundred thousand (<10-5)	Less than one chance in ten thousand (<10-4)	Less than one chance in a thousand (<10-3)	Less than one chance in a hundred (<10-2)

## (B) Impact criteria

Impact title	Definitions
Minor (1)	Service delivery/performance: Minor impact on service, typically up to one day. Financial: financial loss up to 5% of budget. Reputation: Isolated service user/stakeholder complaints contained within business unit/division. Legal/statutory: Litigation claim or find less than £5000. Safety/heatth: Minor incident including injury to one or more individuals. Objectives: Failure to achieve team plan objectives.
Serious (2)	Service delivery/performance: Service disruption 2 to 5 days. Financial: Financial loss up to 10% of budget. Reputation: Adverse local media coverage/multiple service user/state/bolder complaints. Legal/statutory. Litigation daimable fine between £5000 and £50,000. Safety/health: Significant hijury or illness causing short-term disability to one or more persons. Objectives: Pailtine to accimate or more service action.
Major (4)	Service delivery/performance: Service disruption > 1 - 4 weeks. Financial: Financial loss up to 20% of budget Reputation: Adverse national media coverage 1 to 3 days. Legal/statutory: Litigation claimable fine between £50,000 and £500,000. Safety/health: Major injury or illness/disease causing long-term disability to one or more people objectives: Fallure to achieve a strategic plan objective.
Extreme (8)	Service deliveryperformance: Service disruption > 4 weeks. Financial: Financial loss up to 35% of budget. Reputation: National publicity more than three days. Possible resignation leading member or chief officer. Legal/statutory. Multiple civil or criminal suits. Litigation claim or find in excess of £500,000. Safety/health: Fatality or life-threatening illness/disease (e.g. mesuthelioma) to one or more persons. Objectives: Failure to achieve a major corporate objective.

## (C) Risk scoring grid

Likelihood							
Rare (1)	Unlikely ( 2)	Possible (3)	Likely (4)	×			
1	2	3	4	Minor			
Green	Green	Green	Green	(1)			
2	4	6	8	Serious	Im		
Green	Green	Amber	Amber	(2)			
4	8	12	16	Major	bact		
Green	Amber	Amber	Red	(4)			
8	16	24	32	Extreme			
Amber	Red	Red	Red	(8)			

# (D) Risk score definitions

RED	Urgent action required to reduce rating
AMBER	Action required to maintain or reduce rating
GREEN	Action required to maintain rating

Strategy, published in May 2014.

This is an extract from the City of London Corporate Risk Management

Contact the Corporate Risk Advisor for further information. Ext 1297

October 2015

Page 15

#### List of Appeals under the City of London Corporation's Local Government Pensions Scheme

Please note that the information included below is deliberately general so as to avoid providing identifiable personal detail about any cases and therefore be able to be considered in public session. The intention of this document is to provide the Board with an overview of the number, type and success of appeals under the Scheme, rather than to provide details of each specific case.

Year	Appeal Description	Stage 1 – Specified Person	Stage 2 – Appointed Person	Ombudsman
2005	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.	Appeal dismissed.	1st IMA decision queried and thus referred back to City of London
2005	Non-award of ill-health benefits.	Referred back to Admitted Body		
2005	Non-payment of Deferred Benefits on grounds of ill-health	Appeal dismissed.	Appeal dismissed.	
2009	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2009	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2009	Non-award of early payment of deferred benefit on grounds of ill-health retirement.	Referred back to City of London (Police)		
2009	Late application to pension.	Appeal dismissed.		
2009	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Referred back to City of London – Further IMA awarded ill-health retirement		
2009	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2009	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2010	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2011	Abatement case	Appeal dismissed.	Appeal dismissed.	Appeal dismissed with some further comment
2012	Appeal against the award of a specific tier of III-health	Appeal dismissed.		
2012	Non-award of early payment of deferred benefit on grounds of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		

		-		
2012	Appeal against the award of specific tier III-health - benefits.	Appeal dismissed.	Appeal dismissed.	
2015	Appeal against non-acceptance of attempt to reverse decision to transfer in previous benefits.	Appeal dismissed.		
2015	Appeal against the award of a specific tier of III-health.	Appeal dismissed.		
2016	Cessation of a specific tier of III-health benefit. Consideration of an uplift to a different tier.	Appeal dismissed.		
2016	Non release of Deferred benefit from age 55	Appeal dismissed.		
2016	Non-award of ill-health retirement.	Appeal dismissed.		
2017	Cessation of ill-health benefits at 18 month review.	Under consideration		
2017	Non-award of early payment of deferred benefits on grounds of ill-health retirement	Under consideration		

## Agenda Item 10

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

## Agenda Item 11

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted

By virtue of paragraph(s) 3 of Part 1 of Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972.

Document is Restricted